



18 August 2022

Ms G Pham Development Planner Fairfield City Council PO Box 21 Fairfield NSW 1860

Dear Madam,

DA 373/2021 Cabravale Leisure Centre Alterations at 30 Broomfield St Cabramatta Peer Review Status and Response

I refer to the email dated 3rd August 2022 forwarding the peer review architect's second round of comments.

We are concerned the review process is applying design standards and approaches which have not formed part of the design development approach adopted for this proposal. We do not consider it appropriate to enter into a to and fro process modifying the design to accommodate the independent reviewers considerations when these have not been informed by the full design development process (with all of associated information and decisions therein).

A number of the points made by the peer reviewer relate to a guideline adopted as a reference point for an assessment, not the minimum standards applicable. Some of the resulting comments add value to project and are able to be considered. Other comments are not informed by the considerations managed during the design process and, while on face value appear to have merit, they do not provide value for the longer term operations of the centre.

Council has identified those elements where modification can be accommodated. There will remain areas where the reviewer's comments will not be addressed given the stage of the design process and work undertaken to date. These are:

- Additional open deck area decks and location of the café have been considered and dealt with in the current design. Additional locations or changes are not considered appropriate.
- Design with reference to 'Building on Country' this is not part of the design process adopted and piecemeal inclusion at this stage is not considered appropriate.

Landscape design has been carefully considered. While the reviewer has identified this to be increased, the design has sought a balance between the landscape and presentation of the new building. This is considered appropriate and does not need to be screened behind large trees. Other areas of the site are being left unencumbered for future development.







I trust this information is of assistance in finalising the determination of this Development Application.

Yours faithfully,

UD

Burak Turgutoglu Manager Built Systems

Attachments: Peer Review Second Response – FCC's return comments 18.08.2022.



PEER REVIEW UPDATE

of

The proposed extensions to Cabravale Leisure Centre, Fairfield FCC 2nd return comments date: 18.08.2022

Detail review of 7 Objectives

NSW GA ref	TOPIC	ISSUE	RECOMMENDED ACTION	APPLICANT RESPONSE REVIEW COMMENT 020822	Response project team 18.08.2022
	ive 1 BETTER F	T Context			
-	a	The new building is located to the north of existing in a constrained part of the site encumbered by steep hillside, overland flow path and site shape. This results in building that steps up site with graded entry ramp and external areas bridging over an overland flow	resulting external space have been addressed within the analysis.	The applicant has provided detailed masterplan options/review which was undertaken prior to the selection of the current scheme. While the selected scheme which progressed to DA was not the architects preferred plan it has been selected by the client project team on the basis outlined in the concept design verification. On this basis we believe the appropriate steps have been taken to review risks/ opportunities and for an informed decision to be taken by the team.	Item Closed
	b	Car park extension is located to south of existing on flat area adjacent residential boundary	Confirm design teams masterplan options testing validates this approach as most cost effective outcome.	Given the options analysis we believe the appropriate steps have been taken to review risks/ opportunities and for an informed decision to be taken by the team. There does not however appear to have been a review of potential efficiencies within the existing carpark which may have reduced the need for the new bitumen area proposed.	Proposed car park design has addressed the increased demand for car spaces and has provided a holistic circulation design for buses and service vehicles. The current layout was viewed to be more beneficial t the traffic and parking approach when compared to the re- configuration of the existing carpark, which would require re- construction and possible reduction of existing landscaped area. The project team viewed the current proposal as the better overall outcome.
	c	Master planning	Confirm site wide masterplan undertaken to evaluate future uses and design for overall site development over time.	Given the options analysis we believe the appropriate steps have been taken to review risks/ opportunities and for an informed decision to be taken by the team.	Item Closed
	d	external area which has now become enclosed.	Review access to external outdoor space for recreation and all year round access to natural environment. Consider access to sun, wind and seasonal change as well as proximity to road and privacy. The current deck area appears limited in use and especially in winter will have limited sun and high cold wind exposure.	It is unfortunate that the new plan does not address the shortcomings of the existing by colocation of café and outdoor areas in workable and environmentally suitable location. This may have included a deck/outdoor area further west adjacent/ incorporating the bridge. (see image) It does appear that a coffee cart will be used on site to assist with this inadequacy however this will add to the staffing overheads.	While the location of the cafe maybe considered suboptimal, it is not being relocated. Additional decking / outdoors areas has been considered in the design process. The area proposed by the peer revie architect is not considered appropriate as: - the identified area is opposite the existing mechanical plant room ar the outlook / amenity will be greatly reduced by noise and air blowing from the mechanical system - There is a possibility of extreme heat from the directly facing westerr sun and possible heat generated by the close proximity of the two building facades (lack of natural air movement) - The area is disconnected from the pool deck/hall requiring additiona staff / lifeguard to supervise the area. It is important parents supervise children and creation of this area breaks this link (lifeguards do not provide a child minding service) This is not to be incorporated into the design.
	e	Entry distant from public street and dark at night .	Review safe access from public streets for pedestrian and cycling. Adjust paths, lighting and signage to ensure best safe and easy access from train and other public transport. Possibly consider more protected link to entry door.	Applicant response notes that additional lighting is to be included in the new design and that CCTV is included.	item Closed
	f. Natural features and landscape	steeply sloping bank on the north which falls to overland flow path which on the day of visiting was saturated and flooding. The sites landscape is	Review all earth banking to ensure adequate water capture and flow paths especially on those earth banks sloping into new building. It is recommended that additional soft landscape and WSUD be employed to manage the environment in a much more holistic way. This is an opportunity to work with the overland flow to create a WSUD outcome that is part of a public park facility and enhance the local environment and reduce heat island.	Applicant has confirmed engineering reviews support the current design and that additional landscape will be reviewed. It is recommended that additional landscape be included within the DA especially in high publicly visible areas such as North elevations, east adjacent neighbours house, overland flow path /outdoor area. It would also be desirable for more large scale tree planting to be incorporated within the design.	The project team do not agree with proposing additional large trees. The design has a balance between the landscaping and presenting the building to the public space. This provides an easily recognisable location for the public (whether on foot or other transport modes). Th sculptured form of the building create this aspect. Large trees has other implications to be balanced, such as security issues with shadow / non-visible areas and ongoing maintenance i.e. part of the design approach is to minimise opportunity for leaves and branches to fall on roofs and gutters requiring working at heights.

β.	The earth banking to the east on Bareena Street commences directly on the street boundary and appears to grade up to 45degrees. The concern here is that not enough detail included to assess the success. Key issues are that the banks fail commences right on the street boundary and there is no detail of how fencing will be affected or designed. Gradient is very steep and detail planting may not be able to survive the gradient. Maintenance for such a bank on public property should be considered. Drainage down and around at top the bank and below should be considered and any dimensional adjustment be carefully considered now in the set out of the building. Fire hydrant and sewer vent are within this zone and it is recommended that any access/servicing issues be	and sewer vent requirements for review and impact on current building set outs.	It is recommended that additional landscape be included within the DA especially in high publicly visible areas such as the Bareena Street/Broomfield frontage. The detail should include specific design for fencing (noting that Prince Alfred Park Sydney fencing is quoted as precedent) and the edge condition from street kerb to the new building and include any maintenance access paths/signage /gates to ensure a design coordinated outcome. Chain wire fencing can take many forms and given the public domain importance it is essential that any new fencing be high quality and be an appropriate design for such a public building.	Refer to comments in item (1f) above. Project team do not support additional large trees. In relation to fencing, an alternate security fence can be used in public fronting locations instead of chainwire mesh fence. This type of fencing is shown below.
h. Urban context	The new build to the east while constrained by the site	west ensure these provide safe deck and pool	Applicant notes glass to new wing to be double glazed which is supported. It is recommended that the applicant confirm that the extent of west facing glass as a safe outcome for users and for pool glare and that additional shielding/shading is not required.	Pool glare is an identified design criteria for the pool halls. This is to ensure lifeguards are able to view the surface and subsurface of the swimming pool easily. Sections from the Architectural drawings show a min 1.5 metre deep roof overhang designed to provide shielding for glare issues. No additional shading is required.
i.	The proximity to the southern residential neighbour is of concern for scale , noise and light spill.	Confirm adequacy of light spill protection and privacy to south residential. This may mean enhanced screening on the pool building and much denser landscape provision in this green zone between the pool build and the SES access road.	reviewed at next stage however it is recommended that the issues be assessed and a solution be at least proposed as part of the DA and any facade impact outlined. This solution may include scaling device to step to house scale (as shown on image) and additional landscape design which provides a greater level of cover than is currently proposed by the hedge	The design was modified to enclose the pool hall at the eastern end (initial concepts had an open area for the kiddles play feature) to address noise concerns for the neighbour. The design will need to comply with light spill provisions of the relevant Australian Standards and noise considerations. The adjacent neighbour at 62 Bareena Street is 2 metres lower than the proposed pool hall floor level, there is a road with more than 18 metres separations between them and a 1.8m high solid metal fence, there is only one small window on the facade of the property. The implications of the scale of the building has positioned the building as far to the west as is practical within the project constraints. The scale of the eastern aspect of the building.
j. Site conditions	Car park extension is very close to southern neighbours with no or minimal buffer. The acoustic report recommends fence treatment however this does not appear on the plans.	It is considered that the continuation of the existing car park set out into the south part of the site is an inadequate approach and a more significant landscape and screen wall/fence and wider separation be investigated for inclusion. The existing carpark adjacent the residential zone is untidy and inadequate and it is recommended that an overall improvement be sought to the carpark area.	It is noted that 2.1mt timber lapped and capped acoustic fence is included in the DA and that an approximately 1000mm wide planting strip is included. It is recommended that this planting strip be protected from car overhangs/intrusions to allow the full 1000mm for clear planting and that the mix of plants create solid screening.	Upgrading the existing car park is not part of the proposal. The extension of the landscape strip to increase slightly separation from the southern neighbours can be accommodated. Fencing requirements are a commitments arising from the noise study and recommendations. These matters can be addressed through a condition to the DA consent and be incorporated at detailed design stage prior to construction.
k.	Car park numbers and impact	Confirm that the carpark numbers are required and that further efficiency could not be found in the existing carpark to reduce overall site impact. Ensure adequate protection of master planned future needs to the western portion flat site are protected through the minimised construction of any new infrastructure.	The applicant does not appear to have addressed the potential of finding additional carparking within the existing layout. The aim being to reduce the need for additional new bitumen. It is recommended that the traffic engineer confirm that the new bitumen area is actually needed and that efficiencies cannot be found by new line marking/parking layouts within the existing. It is noted that some additional spaces have been included in the existing carparking.	Expected patronage from the new pool hall is driving the new car parking area and reducing car park numbers is not recommended. The other factors are: (1) the treatment of the contaminated material and a containment cell underneath the new car park (significant cost increase if this is not provided), and (2) the need to maintain existing operations with minimal disruption (such as digging up and relaying the existing car park). The proposed car park design has addressed the increased demand for car spaces and has provides better circulation for buses and service vehicles. No changes are proposed.

		There does not appear to be any reference to Building on Country.	Describe /review how building on country has been addressed in the consideration of the sites overall planning and the resulting design.	The Building with Country approach requires consultation in the early stages with local first nations community. In this instance given the advanced stage of the design it is recommended that this occur pre detail design phase for any inputs / discussions that may inform the outcome over and above art overlay. This may include some adjustments to built fabric /landscape design /signage or public domain.	The adopted design process did not adopt the guidelines the project i being measured against. 'Building on Country' and 'connection with fi nation's community' are factors included within the Governments Architect's Guidelines. The current proposal's design is governed by the existing buildings for and presentation and ensuring the new design is sympathetic with an complements the existing design was the governing approach.
	 Existing build nd vegetation 	remove some existing	It is recommended that a more developed and detailed landscape plan be included for the existing and proposed works including WSUD and overland flow and potentially incorporating learning from country or other education initiative to enhance the environment, sustainably and socially.	As previously noted it is recommended that additional landscape be included within the DA for key publicly viewed areas such as north on Bareena frontage/overland flow areas between existing and new and on the east facing elevation to neighbour. It is also desirable to have additional substantial tree plantings in key locations such as Bareena/ Broomfield frontage and east façade to neighbour.	The proposed landscape design is considered appropriate as the CPTE provisions have been managed with the design and landscaping. This integrates the security arrangements, sight lines and landscaping considerations. Landscaping the overland flow channel between the buildings has not been considered to reduce impacts when it functions as a drainage channel. This was developed in consultant with the Architect and Floc Engineer. There is a concern additional trees will reduce visibility into and withit the site, reducing the perception of safety by patrons. The embankment screens and reduces the scale of the proposed building (an intentional design feature) and proposing large trees on the steeper slopes is not recommended. There is a balance in the current design which has been the result of careful consideration regarding presentation of the building, amount and location of landscaping, avoiding encumbering parts of the sites f future development and sightlines to maximise the perception of safet Modifications are not being recommended.
		entry and the generous	Investigate any further potential to enhance vistas through and out of the building by wall openings and increased landscape.	It is not clear what treatment is proposed for the external gym programme area. This is however an interior design element and the following is a suggestion only. This element of the design looks to enclose an existing external courtyard. This may have the effect of creating more internalised corridor/ lobby space where currently outlook is to green . It is recommended that this space be developed at the next stage to reinforce the external character by colour differentiation of floor surfaces, furnishings, minimise the need for frosting or overlay on existing glass which would create internalised lobby and also describe the inclusion of shade devices and potential landscape.	Noted and the design objectives are agreed. The project team will take this into consideration while developing th detailed design
		It is unclear whether this item has been improved or enhanced. Currently most facades of the existing appear to be quite defensive with the exception of the entry area.	Investigate opportunities to soften the existing build exterior. The new build provides good visual connection into and from the street.	Applicant has provided clarification and therefore an acceptable response.	Item Closed
di	istinctive utcome	The new build to the east is distinctive and subject to issues raised in the report will provide a positive contribution to the streetscape by delivering unique landmark building for this public facility.	Test the issues raised to ensure the projects full potential is realised.	Applicant has provided clarification and therefore an acceptable response.	Item Closed

a. Transport	It is not clear if there is a	Test adequacy for safe pedestrian access from	Applicant has provided clarification and therefore an	Item Closed
access and	cycling and public transport	station and public transport as well as cyclists.	acceptable response.	
integration	strategy for the building. It is	Possibly provide additional lighting , paths, covered		
including cycling	likely the building is used after	ways and		
public transport	hours and this sort of access	cycle parking.		
	should be			
	encouraged.			
b. Future change	•		Applicant has provided clarification and therefore an acceptable response.	ltem Closed

	c. Green infrastructure d. Resource efficiency	The landscape solution is minimal and does not appear to meet the level often associated with significant public amenities. This is particularly of concern in and around carparking, overland flow and outdoor areas, banked area adjacent Bareena Street and to the south of new pool adjacent residential. Substantial engineering systems are included within the facility. There does not seem to be a report addressing sustainable initiatives and cost benefit analysis on options for upgrades and shift to different energy systems. It is noted that here not quantified and appear to be limited due to building design and access.	Assess adequacy of landscape response in areas outlined and it is recommended that a more thorough landscape masterplan be established of the site as a significant part of the councils green infrastructure. This should include WSUD initiatives and a more proactive integration of the overland flow, plantings, and the creation of sustainable environment. The separation of the carpark from residential areas to South should be reviewed and wider planting beds, better screening of various size and including more trees as well as acoustic wall. It is recommended that sustainable initiatives be at least tabulated and assessed in separate report for review and that an assessment of cost benefits be undertaken. The extent of PV their location and access for maintenance should be included in any DA to be considered as it may impact visually.	Applicant has not advised on how this links into network of green infrastructure. This may inform species selection as part of a comprehensive precinct/district plan. It is recommended that prior to finalisation of landscape design and ideally as part of the DA this be assessed and used as a guide for future outcomes.	Plant selection is undertaken in conjunction with Council landscape designers and maintenance crews (including this proposal). This includes the use of plants of local provenance and selection of plants and trees appropriate for their locations and maintenance requirements. The scale and nature of the landscape plan also takes into account sight lines and security concerns. These concerns were far more significant when the original redevelopment occurred in 2007 and they influence current designs. Landscaping balances with the lighting and CCTV requirements for patrons security. Council does not have a formal 'network of green infrastructure' plan. Item Closed
	e. Local climate responsive planting and construction materials	The heat sink issues of western Sydney are well known and the specific site issues around water management are evident from recent storm activity.	As noted previously it is recommended that these issues be assessed and included in any design. A SW engineering system should be included in the design so as to coordinate pits and specific flooding issues which appear to be a problem adjoining the SES access road to the east.	Given the public nature of the facility and the potential education resource it could offer with schools patronage, it is recommended that the stormwater management and landscape be explored particularly adjacent the overland flow area as a demonstration of water management and the potential of local flora/fauna and species biodiversity.	While this site has flood management strategies incorporated, they are minor in nature and not considered significant. The educational resources as identified are not considered to match with the nature of the operations on the site and would lack context. This suggestion is not to be proceeded with further.
	f. Design of buildings to optimise environment efficiency	The new pool hall has substantial glazing to east and to west. This may have glare impacts and heat load impact to pool deck and water body.	Review east glazing for safety and environmental impact as well as light spill /privacy to residential neighbour. Review west facing for glare and environmental impacts and address and safety issues.	Applicant notes that the east glazed wall can be reviewed at next stage however it is recommended that the issues around light spill, noise and privary, be assessed and a solution be at least proposed as part of the DA and any façade impact outlined. All as noted previously above at objective 1/ i.	The eastern glazed wall faces adjacent property across the road, 62 Bareena Street. The proposed pool hall's floor level will be over 2 metres above the natural ground line of the adjoining property, there is also a road with more than 18 metres separations between them. The adjoining property has a solid 1.8 m high fence, there is only one small window on the facade of the property. The following were considered. Light: There are proposed trees that will further reduce any light spillage and the opening times for the pool hall is restricted to 6:30am – 9.00pm weekdays and 7:30am – 5.00pm weekends. Noise: The glazed structure is not openable therefore it will limit any noise spillage generated from the inside and no external area is proposed in this area. Also this concept was chosen because it generate the least disturbance. Privacy: There are generous distance separation, level differences and proposed trees between the two properties. The affected area is limited to a small window on the facade. Given all the above, it was viewed that the design has successfully mitigate any issues to the adjoining resident and that the design team believes the current proposal as the better overall outcome.
Objectiv	e 3 BETTER FOR CO a.	MMUNITY Equitable access Wayfinding and signage varies across site	It is recommended that a qualified graphic designer be engaged to review site and internal signage to provide a well-designed comprehensive outcome.	Applicant has provided clarification and therefore an acceptable response.	Item Closed
	b. Internal and external spaces for range of uses	The externally accessible recreation area is minimal and appears to be on south side of the new building with access from one pool only.	Ideally any external space would allow access to sun summer and winter and be well landscaped. The new outdoor pool area is not ideal as it will be screened from winter sun and open to cold winds. The overland flow path may provide an opportunity for appropriate landscape backdrop to the pools. If not the outlook will be quite hard surfaced and to the under croft spaces of the bridge decking from the existing pool.	It is unfortunate that the new plan does not address the shortcomings of the existing by colocation of café and outdoor areas in workable and environmentally suitable location. This may have included a deck/outdoor area further west adjacent/incorporating the bridge. (see image) It does appear that a coffee cart will be used on site to assist with this inadequacy however this will add to the staffing overheads.	Refer to comments in item '1d'.

c. Network of green infrastructure	larger de	design system for green infrastructure as well ressing local site issues already set out in the	Applicant has not advised on how this landscape design links into network of green infrastructure. This may inform species selection as part of a comprehensive precinct/district plan. It is	Please refer to comments in item '2c'
			recommended that prior to finalisation of landscape design and ideally as part of the DA this be assessed and used as a guide for future outcomes.	
jective 4 BETTER FOR PI	EOPLE safe comfortable			
a. Range of experience	spaces and functions. There is café with limited external space however seem to as has already been addressed. an accep The café is internal only and is isolated from the pool areas.	th indoor and external access. This does not o be possible within the current design and is epted limitation. It would be worth reviewing ire this current model is doing the job ly for the users and may be considered	It is unfortunate that the new plan does not address the shortcomings of the existing by colocation of café and outdoor areas in workable and environmentally suitable location. (see previous comments) It does appear that a coffee cart will be used on site to assist with this inadequacy however this will add to the staffing overheads.	

Objective 5 BETTER WORKING Functional efficient and fit for purpose

a. Staffing and management	The various levels and various buildings and links do not necessarily lead to the most efficient staffing.	Confirm that staffing analysis has been undertaken as part of the options to validate the planning outcomes.	Applicant has provided clarification and therefore an acceptable response.	ltem Closed
b. Diverse range of spaces for day and night	There appears to be a vast range of spaces ensure wayfinding and lighting are included to maximise ease of navigation for multicultural and variety of users.	It is recommended that a qualified graphic designer be engaged to review site and internal signage to provide a well-designed comprehensive outcome.	Applicant has provided clarification and therefore an acceptable response for internal signage.	Item Closed

Objective 6 BETTER VALUE creating and adding value

a. Halls for hire	Currently the building hall is	Confirm operational models for halls, café etc and	Applicant has provided clarification and therefore an	Item Closed
and access	occupied by childcare facility.	assess any implications.	acceptable response.	
	Ensure the range of external			
	users' needs have been			
	included . There is a trend to			
	outsource to private operators			
	the spaces for gyms, cafes etc			
	and it is not clear if this has			
	been considered. There may be			
	implications to access, security			
	and			
	deliveries.			
b. IT and 3 rd	As above	As above	Applicant has provided	Item Closed
party operators			clarification and therefore an acceptable response.	
c. Whole of life		This is a standard part of building design and it is	Applicant has provided clarification and therefore an	Item Closed
initiatives		worth confirming that a review has been undertaken	acceptable response.	
/review		by the design team.		
Ongoing energy		This is a standard part of building design and it is	Applicant has provided clarification and therefore an	Item Closed
use		worth confirming that a review has been undertaken		
		by the design team.		
e. Future adaption	1	This is a standard part of building	Applicant has provided clarification and therefore an	Item Closed
and masterplan		design and it is worth confirming that a review has	acceptable response.	
modern		been undertaken by the design team to ensure		
technologies s		adaptable systems are installed where appropriate.		
flexibility				
	1			

Objective 7 BETTER LOOK AND FEEL engaging inviting and attractive

a. Landscape integration	The landscape requires more detail design and larger budget and review as previously noted.	Refer previous comments.	The proposed landscape plan has been carefully considered and is considered appropriate (note the comments provided for other items including '1m').
	It is recommended that a qualified graphic designer be engaged to review site and internal signage to provide a well-designed comprehensive outcome.	Applicant has provided clarification and therefore an acceptable response.	ltem Closed
Public art	This is an important part of any public building and it is recommended that this be considered as part of the building and site development.	It is recommended that specific budget and process for public art be allocated as part of the DA.	Public Art options will be reviewed at Detail Design stage before construction. There are many facets that needs to be considered for in developing public art such as cost, subject, type of artwork and its lifecycle. Not least of these is any artwork will need to fit the final overall building design. Setting a specific budget and process is not considered appropriate as part of a planning application determination (as part of a planning agreement perhaps).
inclusive		Applicant has provided clarification and therefore an acceptable response.	ltem Closed

e. Fencing and	The fences especially on the public streets will have It	t is recommended that additional landscape be	See earlier comment on an alternate fencing type.
perimeter edges	significant visual impact and have not been in	ncluded within the DA especially in high publicly	
	described in the drawings and perspectives. It is	visible areas such as the Bareena Street/Broomfield	
	considered that chain mesh fencing on highly visual fr	rontage.	
	street edges/boundary's is not satisfactory and that a		
	more appropriate design be included.	The detail should include specific design for fencing (
	n	noting that Prince Alfred Park Sydney fencing is	
	q	uoted as precedent) and the edge condition from	
	si	treet kerb to the new building and include any	
	n	naintenance access paths/signage /gates to ensure a	
	d	design coordinated outcome.	
	c	Chain wire fencing can take many forms and given the	
	p	public domain importance it is essential that any new	
	fe	encing be high quality and be an appropriate design	
	fc	or such a public building.	